

Allerton and Belle Vale LLAR Pilot Intelligence Report

1. Purpose of the Report

- 1.1 The purpose of this report is to provide a detailed analysis of the LLAR pilot at Belle Vale and Allerton Fire Stations in respect of mobilisation, socio economic and risk data appertaining to both stations.

2. Recommendation

- 2.1 That the LLAR duty system is implemented at Allerton and Belle Vale Fire Stations.

3. Introduction and Background

- 3.1 The 6 LLAR month pilot at Belle Vale Fire Station and Allerton Fire Station commenced on 1st February 2007 and concluded on 31st July 2007.
- 3.2 This report provides a detailed analysis of the pilot in respect of mobilization, socio economic and risk data appertaining to both stations as required by the Agreement of Principles between Merseyside Fire and Rescue Authority and the Fire Brigades Union.

4. LLAR definition criteria

- 4.1 The document Merseyside Fire and Rescue Authority Definition of LLAR agreed with the Fire Brigades Union outlines four areas to be considered when determining the suitability of a station for the LLAR duty system. These four areas are;
- Low Level of Activity
 - Life risk
 - Risk to Firefighters
 - Risk of incident

5. Activity Levels

- 5.1 The Merseyside Fire and Rescue Authority Definition of LLAR document details that activity levels in respect of emergency response to each stations own area will be considered as low by MFRA if the number of calls per annum is below 825. A summary of activity levels in respect of emergency response to each stations own area during the pilot and for the previous 3 years is detailed below.

Allerton and Belle Vale LLAR Pilot Intelligence Report
Allerton and Belle Vale total mobilisations within station area

Summary of Incident Types
Allerton

	2004-2005	2004-2005 %	2005-2006	2005-2006 %	2006-2007	2006-2007 %	Pilot	Pilot%
Dwelling Fires (01)	23	4%	19	4.04%	16	2.94%	6	2.47%
Other Building Fires (02)	26	4%	24	5.11%	22	4.04%	16	6.58%
Other FDR 1 Fires (03)	54	8%	43	9.15%	45	8.26%	13	5.35%
Secondary Fires (04)	109	17%	35	7.45%	130	23.85%	51	20.99%
Special Service Calls (06 - 14)	99	15%	83	17.66%	95	17.43%	50	20.58%
False Alarms (15,16, 17)	325	50%	262	55.74%	230	42.20%	100	41.15%
Other	10	2%	4	0.85%	7	1.28%	7	2.88%
Total	646	100.00%	470	100.00%	545	100.00%	243	100.00%

Summary of Incident Types
Belle Vale

	2004-2005	2004-2005 %	2005-2006	2005-2006 %	2006-2007	2006-2007 %	Pilot	Pilot%
Dwelling Fires (01)	27	4%	18	3.85%	25	3.94%	14	4.56%
Other Building Fires (02)	32	5%	22	4.71%	41	6.46%	16	5.21%
Other FDR 1 Fires (03)	112	17%	86	18.42%	76	11.97%	54	17.59%
Secondary Fires (04)	234	35%	130	27.84%	283	44.57%	121	39.41%
Special Service Calls (06 - 14)	80	12%	59	12.63%	68	10.71%	27	8.79%
False Alarms (15,16, 17)	178	27%	151	32.33%	135	21.26%	72	23.45%
Other	7	1%	1	0.21%	7	1.10%	3	0.98%
Total	670	100.00%	467	100.00%	635	100.00%	307	100.00%

5.2 For the purposes of analysis, the 6 months between 1st February and 31st July are considered as the period during which the pilot was undertaken, although in reality the Watch Manager working from Allerton was on A/L in February and therefore did not undertake the pilot till 1st March.

6. Life Risk

- 6.1 In relation to life risk the Merseyside Fire and Rescue Authority Definition of LLAR document determines the point of reference for social deprivation as the DCLG document Index of Multiple Deprivation.
- 6.2 The tables shown at Appendix A detail each Super Output Area (SOA) within the Allerton and Belle Vale station areas in relation to their relative position within the index. The SOA with a rank of 1 is the most deprived, and 32482 the least deprived, on this overall measure.
- 6.3 Analysis of the tables for both Allerton and Belle Vale station areas demonstrate that neither contains SOA's with significant levels of deprivation.

Allerton and Belle Vale LLAR Pilot Intelligence Report

7. Risk to Firefighters

- 7.1 In relation to risk to Firefighters neither station area contains any COMAH sites or other sites of special risk which present any significant hazards to Firefighters or the public.
- 7.2 The Allerton station area contains five heritage sites which are listed below. There are no heritage sites on the Belle Vale station area.

Allerton Heritage Sites

Sudley Art Gallery
Palm House Sefton Park
20, Forthlin Road (Paul McCartney's house)
251, Menlove Avenue (John Lennon's house)
12, Arnold Grove (George Harrison's house)

8. Risk of Incidents

- 8.1 In relation to risk of incidents, analysis of the data appertaining to deprivation in conjunction with the tables which relate to the activity levels in respect of emergency response to each stations own area show that both stations have low levels of calls and risk.

9. Accommodation

- 9.1 In their summaries (see below), both Watch Managers identify locations which they believe will provide suitable accommodation for personnel working the LLAR duty system.
- 9.2 At Allerton, the house which is currently used by Liverpool Fire Safety is separate from the station in accordance with the recommendations of the Technical Advisory Panel. This house is suitable for conversion to provide quality accommodation for personnel working the LLAR duty system.
- 9.3 At Belle Vale, the offices currently used by Liverpool Fire Safety can be physically separated from the main body of the station by bricking up the access door into the corridor between the offices and the station itself. These offices are suitable for conversion to provide quality accommodation for personnel working the LLAR duty system.
- 9.4 In the event that the accommodation proposed above is deemed not fit for purpose the Station Locality Manager for Allerton and Belle Vale has been tasked with identifying suitable accommodation for either purchase or rent within a 1.9 minute isochrone run from either station.

10. Observations from the Watch Managers Involved in the Pilot

10.1 Both Watch Managers were required to submit a monthly report on progress to the Director of Performance and Values for the duration of the trial.

10.2 The feedback from both Watch Managers is summarised below.

Watch Manager Belle Vale

Each of the 6 months of the trial has followed the same call pattern, that is, there have been few calls and the majority of these have been anti social small fires or false alarms.

I believe that Belle Vale would be an ideal station to convert to a full LLAR station. The break down of the calls I attended can back this up.

In a 6 month period, which in effect relates to the equivalent time scale of a person working 2, 2, 4 for 1 year, I have only attended 10 FDR 1 calls and this in 23 tours of duty.

All the calls I have attended during my retained hours in my 6 month trial totaled 47. Taking all these calls into consideration it works out at 2 calls per tour of duty. As the station was still working the 2, 2, 4 shift system and only I was on the LLAR trial the appliance was sent to all types of calls. In reality if this station was working the LLAR shift system then I would have attended significantly fewer calls during my retained period. If the station was working the LLAR shift pattern then the average calls during the retained period would have dropped to approximately 1 call per shift.

On a personal note I have enjoyed every minute of working this shift pattern. I have found the accommodation provided for me, during the trial, to be comfortable enough to make my stay on station, during the retained hours, a pleasant experience.

I feel great in myself, working this system at Belle Vale has in no way had any detrimental effects on me. Evidence on the month end returns shows that it has had the opposite effect and station targets have increased with the watches I have worked with, within this time.

I have also had numerous Operational Assurance visits where I have been able to perform my duties to a very high standard, again proving that there have been no detrimental effects working this system.

During my time trialing this shift pattern I have engaged in numerous conversations with station personnel, over the topic of LLAR. The one main factor that everyone has enquired about is what the living accommodation will be like prior to the station being rebuilt with the PFI funding.

Allerton and Belle Vale LLAR Pilot Intelligence Report

During these conversations all personnel have expressed the same opinion, which is an opinion that I wholeheartedly agree with, and that is that the Fire Safety annex attached to the station would afford the best accommodation site until the new station is built.

I have in the past months discussed the accommodation issue with the union officials on the station. Both officials gave very good and constructive opinions on the question of accommodation. Both officials agreed that the Fire Safety site would afford the most secure and cost effective accommodation until the station was rebuilt using PFI funding.

I believe that the Fire Safety site would be the best option for accommodation as all the infrastructure is in place i.e. kitchen, phone and tannoy system, recreation room and large rooms that can be converted to bedrooms with en suite facilities.

The turn out time from the accommodation would be as quick if not quicker than turning out from the station, due to the vast size of the station, so affording the local community the same standard if not an even better service and turn out speed.

Another factor that has been brought up in discussions with station personnel over using the Fire Safety site was the question of security. Due to the position of the station, the overwhelming view expressed by station personnel I have spoken to, is that they would not feel safe living in accommodation away from the station as it may be a target for burglaries when they would turn out. The overall feeling is that the accommodation should be built in the confines of the station grounds. These views extend to when consideration is being sought as to where the accommodation should be placed using the PFI funding.

I have thoroughly enjoyed my time on this trial and hope that I can play a part in the introduction of this system being introduced to Belle Vale or Allerton.

Watch Manager Allerton.

Having completed the initial five month pilot period under the proposed LLAR duty system, I submit this final report offering some insight and reflection on what it was actually like to work this system as an individual, (whilst the rest of the station remained 2, 2, 4), and some of the problems that surfaced due to the very nature of the pilot itself.

Primarily the main problem was managing my own personal rest time in order that I remain fresh for the oncoming watch after retained hour's turnouts. In the breakdown of figures you will notice that there were 29 occasions out of a total of 54 when I was required to respond between the hours of midnight and eight in the morning, this became a particular problem when there were consecutive nights of retained activity when faced the following day with for example, an off station multi pump exercise or programmed crew based training, understandably this was an anomaly that would not present itself as frequently if the whole station/watch were to undertake the LLAR system but by the very

Allerton and Belle Vale LLAR Pilot Intelligence Report

nature of the business we are in i.e. fire and rescue, there will be occasions even under full LLAR implementation when these situations will occur, and I believe it essential that the Watch Manager be given full authority to manage stand down periods / rest times accordingly.

Secondly albeit this was something I eventually adapted to, was the sense of permanently being on duty, due to the fact that my accommodation was the station office and the small rest room annexed from it, again this was a problem peculiar to the pilot itself and would be self solving under full LLAR implementation.

With regard to accommodation Allerton is not faced with the cost outlay of firstly locating, and then acquiring, a premises for use within the 1.9 minuet time of alert requirement, there is, annexed to the station yard, but not attached to the station, an original purpose built firefighters house presently occupied by Liverpool fire safety (ground floor) and station gymnasium (first floor) which is ideally suited for conversion and because of its proximity to the station turnout times should remain unaffected.

During the period of the pilot itself I am pleased to say that I was warmly received by the members of all three watches for which I now held responsibility, but I am unable to report any interest shown by any of the watch members with regard to an expression of interest to join the new system of working should it be introduced. It must be stressed however that this is only a personal opinion based on feedback received during my time here under the pilot, this of course may change when / if official expressions of interest are sought.

In general terms, there is an overall acceptance of the inevitability of Allerton moving towards the LLAR system of crewing. Although there are some who believe this ought not to be the case, others quite naturally are beginning show concerns regarding their personal future, particularly with regard to re location, bearing in mind that management will be looking to re locate a similar number of personnel perhaps simultaneously, from Belle Vale thus reducing the availability of preferred postings.

These questions are quite natural and I believe will be the main area of concern from station personnel as we move into the consultation period.

In conclusion, and from a solely personal point of view, I found the pilot an interesting experience both in terms of challenge, from the working hours point of view, and also from the managerial aspect of addressing the requirements, training needs, and station targets of three individual watches, the latter I am pleased to report increased month on month as the pilot progressed.

There will be some I am sure who will be disappointed at the introduction of this new working system, but having worked it as an individual I am sure it will be a success once implemented in its correct and intended format.

11. Conclusions

- 11.1 The mobilisation data for both stations falls within the criteria outlined within the Merseyside Fire and Rescue Authority Definition of LLAR agreed with the Fire Brigades Union.
- 11.2 By reference to the Index of Multiple Deprivation it can be seen that neither station area has significant levels of deprivation, rather both areas contain relatively affluent suburbs.
- 11.3 Neither station has a COMAH site or any other special or significant risk which would present a risk to Firefighters or the public.
- 11.4 Both stations have building stock which is either separate from or could easily be made separate from the main body of the station in accordance with the TAP recommendations and which affords the opportunity for conversion to high quality accommodation for crews working the LLAR system.
- 11.5 Both Watch Managers who undertook the pilot acknowledge the fact that the pilot conditions do not accurately reflect the situation if the whole Watch were working LLAR. That is to say the work routine on LLAR duty system allows the Watch Managers more flexibility to account for the fact that in the event that the crew have been mobilised during the retained hours this can be taken into account during the following shift. Notwithstanding the above, the mobilising procedures for LLAR stations determine that an LLAR appliance is relieved if they are committed to an incident for in excess of one hour during the retained duty period.
- 11.6 In summary, both Watch Managers completed the pilot with no detrimental issues identified and offered workable solutions to the issues they saw as requiring to be addressed.

Appendix A
IMD rankings for Allerton

Allerton and Belle Vale LLAR Pilot Intelligence Report

IMD

Station Ground	SOA	RANK OF IMD (where 1 is most deprived)
S1	E01006721	444
S1	E01006522	1006
S1	E01006551	2702
S1	E01006521	4683
S1	E01006534	5115
S1	E01006550	6283
S1	E01006528	6403
S1	E01006526	7118
S1	E01006681	7510
S1	E01006553	7556
S1	E01006588	7656
S1	E01006724	8363
S1	E01006590	8440
S1	E01006527	9463
S1	E01006593	9704
S1	E01006529	10414
S1	E01006595	10617
S1	E01006555	11565
S1	E01006591	11747
S1	E01006519	12372
S1	E01006596	12778
S1	E01006539	14427
S1	E01006589	14474
S1	E01006684	15081
S1	E01006689	15383
S1	E01006577	15439
S1	E01006525	15609
S1	E01006524	15900
S1	E01006597	16180
S1	E01006592	16336
S1	E01006682	17562
S1	E01006680	17827
S1	E01006532	18744
S1	E01006581	18756
S1	E01006582	19498
S1	E01006796	22465
S1	E01006594	22646

rankings for Belle Vale

Allerton and Belle Vale LLAR Pilot Intelligence Report

Station Ground	SOA	RANK OF IMD (where 1 is most deprived)
S9	E01006769	261
S9	E01006770	466
S9	E01006775	608
S9	E01006771	651
S9	E01006430	792
S9	E01006709	875
S9	E01006706	882
S9	E01006707	980
S9	E01006708	1860
S9	E01006433	3530
S9	E01006797	3911
S9	E01006772	4006
S9	E01006710	4533
S9	E01006799	6007
S9	E01006425	7566
S9	E01006533	8654
S9	E01006793	9564
S9	E01006578	9579
S9	E01006773	10957
S9	E01006420	12728
S9	E01006794	13223
S9	E01006774	13717
S9	E01006419	14234
S9	E01006423	14357
S9	E01006422	14642
S9	E01006531	14661
S9	E01006424	14998
S9	E01006800	15373
S9	E01006801	15708
S9	E01006579	16148
S9	E01006421	16773
S9	E01006798	17022
S9	E01006530	17900
S9	E01006795	18056
S9	E01006792	18702
S9	E01006580	21784
S9	E01006583	26432